

## Harkness Discussion Protocols

### Rules:

- As the teacher, I am only to involve myself in the discussion for correctives (off-topic, time keeping, etc.) and that role should fade over time
- Students prepare opinions/ questions about a text beforehand
- No talking over each other (give 3 second pauses)
- Get to the point (within 15 seconds) and deal with ONE point at a time
- Respect the speaker by referring to his or her previous remarks by name
- Don't be defensive and don't be certain about anything--be OPEN
- Draw out something specific from the text or from others' comments
- Challenge or dispute others or texts with RESPECT and COURTESY
- You are talking to the class, not to an individual and NOT to me

### Prompts:

#### *Ask*

- I'm not clear why...
- Can someone explain...
- Could you elaborate...

#### *Affirm*

- I agree with \_\_\_\_\_ because...
- That makes sense because...

#### *Test for Understanding*

- What do you think the passage on page \_\_\_ is trying to say?
- Do you mean...

#### *Develop an Idea*

- On page \_\_\_ it says...
- Building on what \_\_\_\_\_ said, I think that...

#### *Clarify a Difference of Opinion*

- I understand your point, but on page \_\_\_ it says...
- What do you mean by...

#### *Make a Transition*

- Something else I think is worth looking at...
- There's a related passage on page ...

#### *Return to Lost Points*

- I would like to go back to...

#### *Synthesize*

- I believe that \_\_\_\_\_ and \_\_\_\_\_ are making two points that may be related because...

#### *Facilitate*

- I'd like to hear what \_\_\_\_\_ thinks about this point.
- I feel like we might want to move on to other topics; does anyone have something that they haven't had a chance to bring up yet?

## Costa's Levels of Thinking

Costa's Level	Cognitive Functions	Sample Questions
<p><b>Level 3:</b>  <b>Applying Information</b>                      Demonstrates mastering of knowledge learned (OUTPUT)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Apply</li> <li>• Create</li> <li>• Evaluate</li> <li>• Generate</li> <li>• Synthesize</li> <li>• Imagine</li> <li>• Judge</li> <li>• Modify</li> <li>• Predict</li> <li>• Speculate</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• What would happen to _____ if _____?</li> <li>• What would it be like to live...?</li> <li>• Pretend you are a character in the story and....</li> <li>• What do you think will happen to _____? Why?</li> <li>• Could this story have really happened? Why or why not?</li> <li>• How would you solve this problem in your life?</li> <li>• How does the author's claim hold up under these circumstances: _____?</li> <li>• What if the situation changed to ____; how would that impact the outcome?</li> </ul>
<p><b>Level 2:</b>  <b>Processing Information</b>                      Practice knowledge learned (PROCESS)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Analyze</li> <li>• Categorize</li> <li>• Compare</li> <li>• Contrast</li> <li>• Demonstrate</li> <li>• Develop</li> <li>• Group</li> <li>• Infer</li> <li>• Organize</li> <li>• Relate</li> <li>• Sequence</li> <li>• Synthesize</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Would you have done the same thing as...?</li> <li>• How are _____ and _____ alike and different?</li> <li>• What was important about...?</li> <li>• What other ways could _____ be interpreted?</li> <li>• What is the main idea of the story (event)?</li> <li>• What information supports your explanation?</li> <li>• What does _____ mean?</li> <li>• What does _____ suggest about _____'s character?</li> <li>• What lines of the poem express the poet's feelings about _____?</li> <li>• What is the author trying to prove?</li> </ul>
<p><b>Level 1:</b>  <b>Gathering Information</b>                      Introduction of knowledge (INPUT)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Define</li> <li>• Describe</li> <li>• Find</li> <li>• Identify</li> <li>• List</li> <li>• Locate</li> <li>• Name</li> <li>• Observe</li> <li>• Recite</li> <li>• Report</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• What information is given?</li> <li>• Where does _____ happen?</li> <li>• When did the event take place?</li> <li>• What are...?</li> <li>• Where did...?</li> <li>• What is...?</li> <li>• Who was/were...?</li> <li>• What part of the story shows...?</li> <li>• What is the origin of the word _____?</li> <li>• What events led to _____?</li> </ul>